# Foundations of Operations Research Practice exercises: Linear Programming

M. Ciavotta

revised version by O. Jabali

2018/2019

Solve the following linear problem graphically:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \max & 2x_1 + x_2 \\ \text{s.t.} & 2x_1 + x_2 \leq 10 \\ & x_1 \leq 4 \\ & x_2 \leq 5 \\ & x_1, x_2 \geq 0. \end{array}$$

# Solution



Figure 1: Polyhedron of the feasible solutions

The red lines correspond to the level curves of the objective function for z = 8and z = 10. The blue arrow represents the gradient of the objective function. All the points laying in the segment (A, B) represent solution with value 10, and are optimal solutions. However, only  $x_A = (2.5, 5)$  and  $x_B = (4, 2)$  are vertices, so there are two optimal basic solutions and an infinite number of non-basic optimal solutions.

Solve the following linear problem graphically:

min 
$$-x_1 - x_2$$
  
s.t.  
 $-3x_1 + 2x_2 \ge 6$   
 $3x_1 + x_2 \ge 9$   
 $x_1, x_2 \ge 0.$ 

Solution



Figure 2: Polyhedron of the feasible solutions

The red lines correspond to the level curves of the objective function for z = 8and  $z = -\frac{19}{3}$ . The blue arrow represents gradient of the objective function. The objective function can decrease indefinitely, thus the problem is unbounded.

Determine using the Simplex algorithm with Bland's rule the optimal solution to the following linear programming problem:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \max & x_1 + 3x_2 + 5x_3 + 2x_4 \\ \text{s.t.} & x_1 + 2x_2 + 3x_3 + x_4 \leq 3 \\ & 2x_1 + x_2 + x_3 + 2x_4 \leq 4 \\ & x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in \mathbb{R}^+. \end{array}$$

## Solution

The problem in standard form is:

min 
$$-x_1 - 3x_2 - 5x_3 - 2x_4$$
  
s.t.  $x_1 + 2x_2 + 3x_3 + x_4 + s_1 = 3$   
 $2x_1 + x_2 + x_3 + 2x_4 + s_2 = 4$ 

The initial tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$x_4$	$s_1$	$s_2$
	0	-1	-3	-5	-2	0	0
$s_1$	3	1	2	3	1	1	0
$s_2$	4	2	1	1	2	0	1

**Iteration 1**: Using Bland's rule  $x_1$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{3}{1}, \frac{4}{2}\} = 2$ , thus  $s_2$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$x_4$	$s_1$	$s_2$
	2	0	-2.5	-4.5	-1	0	0.5
$s_1$	1	0	1.5	2.5	0	1	-0.5
$x_1$	2	1	0.5	0.5	1	0	0.5

**Iteration 2**: Using Bland's rule  $x_2$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{1}{1.5}, \frac{2}{0.5}\} = 0.67$ , thus  $s_1$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$x_4$	$s_1$	$s_2$
	3.67	0	0	-0.33	-1	1.67	-0.33
$x_2$	0.67	0	1	1.67	0	0.67	-0.33
$x_1$	1.67	1	0	-0.33	1	-0.33	0.67

**Iteration 3**: Using Bland's rule  $x_3$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{0.67}{1.67}\} = 0.4$ , thus  $x_2$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$x_4$	$s_1$	$s_2$
	3.8	0	0.2	0	-1	1.8	-0.4
$x_3$	0.4	0	0.6	1	0	0.4	-0.2
$x_1$	1.8	1	0.2	0	1	-0.2	0.6

**Iteration 4**: Using Bland's rule  $x_4$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{1.8}{1}\} = 1.8$ , thus  $x_1$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$x_4$	$s_1$	$s_2$
	5.6	1	0.4	0	0	1.6	0.2
$x_3$	0.4	0	0.6	1	0	0.4	-0.2
$x_4$	1.8	1	0.2	0	1	-0.2	0.6

All the reduced costs are nonnegative, then the optimal solution to the problem is the basis  $(x_1, x_4)$  with values:

$$x_B = \left[ \begin{array}{c} 0.4\\ 1.8 \end{array} \right]$$

The value associated with the optimal solution is 5.6 (the original problem is a maximization one).

#### Exercise 4

Determine using the Simplex algorithm with Bland's rule the optimal solution to the following linear programming problem:

min 
$$-5x_1 - 2x_2 - 3x_3 - x_4$$
  
s.t.  $x_1 - 2x_2 + 2x_3 + 2x_4 \le 4$   
 $-x_1 + x_2 + x_3 - x_4 \le 6$   
 $x_i \ge 0.$ 

# Solution

The problem in standard form is:

min 
$$-5x_1 - 2x_2 - 3x_3 - x_4$$
  
s.t.  $x_1 - 2x_2 + 2x_3 + 2x_4 + s_1 = 4$   
 $-x_1 + x_2 + x_3 - x_4 + s_2 = 6$   
 $x_i, s_i \ge 0.$ 

The initial tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$x_4$	$s_1$	$s_2$
	0	-5	-2	-3	-1	0	0
$s_1$	4	1	-2	2	2	1	0
$s_2$	6	-1	1	1	-1	0	1

**Iteration 1**: Using Bland's rule  $x_1$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{4}{1}\} = 4$ , thus  $s_1$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$x_4$	$s_1$	$s_2$
	20	0	-12	7	9	5	0
$x_1$	4	1	-2	2	2	1	0
$s_2$	10	0	-1	3	1	1	1

**Iteration 2**: The only candidate variable to enter the basis is  $x_2$ . However, Since all the elements  $\bar{a}[i, s]$  are negative (i.e., -2,-1), the considered problem is unbounded  $(z = -\infty)$ .

#### Exercise 5

Solve the following linear programming problem using the Simplex algorithm with Bland's rule:

min  $3x_1 + x_2 + x_3$ s.t.  $2x_1 + x_2 + x_3 = 6$  $x_1 + x_2 + 2x_3 = 2$  $x_1, x_2, x_3 \ge 0.$ 

# Solution

We will execute the two-phase simplex method. In phase one we try to find a basic feasible expressed in canonical form. The auxiliary problem is:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \min & w_1 + w_2 \\ \text{s.t.} & 2x_1 + x_2 + x_3 + w_1 = 6 \\ & x_1 + x_2 + 2x_3 + w_2 = 2 \\ & x_1, x_2, x_3, w_1, w_2 \geq 0. \end{array}$$

We express the objective function in terms of the nonbasic variables.

$$w_1 = 6 - 2x_1 - x_2 - x_3$$
$$w_2 = 2 - x_1 - x_2 - 2x_3$$

Therefore,

$$w_1 + w_2 = 8 - 3x_1 - 2x_2 - 3x_3.$$

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$w_1$	$w_2$
	-8	-3	-2	-3	0	0
$w_1$	6	2	1	1	1	0
$w_2$	2	1	1	2	0	1

**Iteration 1**: Using Bland's rule  $x_1$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{6}{2}, \frac{2}{1}\} = 2$ , thus  $w_2$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$w_1$	$w_2$
	-2	0	1	3	0	3
$w_1$	2	0	-1	-3	1	-2
$x_1$	2	1	1	2	0	1

The reduced cost are all nonnegative. The optimal solution is  $[w_1, x_1] = [2, 2]$  is with an objective function value of 2. Since the objective function value of the first stage is strictly positive (and not zero) the original problem is infeasible.

#### Exercise 6

Consider the following linear programming problem:

$$\max 2x_{1} + x_{2}$$

$$-2x_{1} - x_{2} \leq -1$$

$$x_{1} - x_{2} \leq 3$$

$$4x_{1} + x_{2} \leq 17$$

$$x_{2} \leq 5$$

$$-x_{1} + x_{2} \leq 4$$

where  $x_1, x_2 \ge 0$ .

- a) Write the dual problem of the given problem.
- b) Write the equations defining the complementarity slackness for the given problem (Notice that the problem and its dual are in symmetric form).
- c) Exploiting the complementarity conditions say whether points (3,5) and (4,1) are optimal.

# Solution

Part a)

$$\min -y_1 + 3y_2 + 17y_3 + 5y_4 + 4y_5 -2y_1 + y_2 + 4y_3 - y_5 \ge 2 -y_1 - y_2 + y_3 + y_4 + y_5 \ge 1 y_1, y_2, y_3, y_4, y_5 \ge 0$$

#### Part b)

The equations of complementary slackness are:

$$(-2x_1 - x_2 + 1)y_1 = 0$$
  

$$(x_1 - x_2 - 3)y_2 = 0$$
  

$$(4x_1 + x_2 - 17)y_3 = 0$$
  

$$(x_2 - 5)y_4 = 0$$
  

$$(-x_1 + x_2 - 4)y_5 = 0$$
  

$$(-2y_1 + y_2 + 4y_3 - y_5 - 2)x_1 = 0$$
  

$$(-y_1 - y_2 + y_3 + y_4 + y_5 - 1)x_2 = 0$$

Part c)

Point (3,5) is feasible for the primal problem. By using the equations of complementary slackness we have that:

$$(-2x_1 - x_2 + 1)y_1 = 0 \Rightarrow y_1 = 0$$
  

$$(x_1 - x_2 - 3)y_2 = 0 \Rightarrow y_2 = 0$$
  

$$(-x_1 + x_2 - 4)y_5 = 0 \Rightarrow y_5 = 0$$
  

$$x_1 > 0 \Rightarrow 4y_3 = 2$$
  

$$x_2 > 0 \Rightarrow y_3 + y_4 = 1$$

We get that  $y_3 = \frac{1}{2}$ ,  $y_4 = \frac{1}{2}$ , which is a feasible solution to the dual problem and thus (3,5) is optimal.

Point (4,1) is feasible for the primal problem. By using the equations of complementary slackness we have that:

$$(-2x_1 - x_2 + 1)y_1 = 0 \Rightarrow y_1 = 0$$
  

$$(x_2 - 5)y_4 = 0 \Rightarrow y_4 = 0$$
  

$$(-x_1 + x_2 - 4)y_5 = 0 \Rightarrow y_5 = 0$$
  

$$x_1 > 0 \Rightarrow y_2 + 4y_3 = 2$$
  

$$x_2 > 0 \Rightarrow -y_2 + y_3 = 1$$

We get that  $y_2 = -\frac{2}{5}$ ,  $y_3 = \frac{3}{5}$ , which is not a feasible solution to the dual problem and thus (4,1) is not optimal.

Consider the following problem:

$$\max z = 9x_1 + 8x_2$$

$$x_1 - 2x_2 \leq -1$$

$$4x_1 + 3x_2 \leq 4$$

$$-x_1 + 2x_2 \leq 3$$

$$2x_1 - x_2 \leq -4$$

Verify if solution  $x_1 = -3$ ,  $x_2 = -1$  is optimal. Verify if solution  $x_1 = -\frac{5}{3}$ ,  $x_2 = \frac{2}{3}$  is optimal.

# Solution

The dual problem is:

 $\min z_D = -y_1 + 4y_2 + 3y_3 - 4y_4$ 

$$y_1 + 4y_2 - y_3 + 2y_4 = 9$$
  
$$-2y_1 + 3y_2 + 2y_3 - y_4 = 8$$
  
$$y_i \ge 0 \ \forall i$$

The equations of complementary slackness are:

$$(x_1 - 2x_2 + 1)y_1 = 0$$
  

$$(4x_1 + 3x_2 - 4)y_2 = 0$$
  

$$(-x_1 + 2x_2 - 3)y_3 = 0$$
  

$$(2x_1 - x_2 + 4)y_4 = 0$$
  

$$(y_1 + 4y_2 - y_3 + 2y_4 - 9)x_1 = 0$$
  

$$(-2y_1 + 3y_2 + 2y_3 - y_4 - 8)x_2 = 0$$

Point (-3,-1) is feasible for the primal problem (z = -35). By using the equations of complementary slackness we infer that the dual variable  $y_2$ ,  $y_3$  and  $y_4$  are equal to 0. Therefore,

$$\begin{array}{rcl} y_1 &=& 9\\ -2y_1 &=& 8 \end{array}$$

This system has no feasible solution. Therefore the solution  $x_1 = -3, x_2 = -1$  is not optimal.

Point  $\left(-\frac{5}{3}, \frac{2}{3}\right)$  is feasible for the primal problem  $\left(z = -\frac{29}{3}\right)$ . By using the equations of complementary slackness we infer that the dual variable  $y_1$  and  $y_2$  are equal to 0.

Considering values  $x_1 = -\frac{5}{3}$ ,  $x_2 = \frac{2}{3}$   $(z = -\frac{29}{3})$ , constraints (3) and (4) hold with equality. Dual variable  $y_1$  and  $y_2$  are equal to 0 for the condition of complementary slackness. Therefore,

$$\begin{array}{rcl} -y_3 + 2y_4 &=& 9\\ +2y_3 - y_4 &=& 8 \end{array}$$

We get that  $y_3 = \frac{25}{3}$ ,  $y_4 = \frac{26}{3}$ , which is a feasible solution to the dual problem and thus  $\left(-\frac{5}{3}, \frac{2}{3}\right)$  is optimal.

# Exercise 8

Consider the following Linear Programming problem:

$$\min -x_1 + 2x_2 \tag{1}$$

$$-x_1 + x_2 \leq 2 \tag{2}$$

$$x_1 + x_3 = 3 \tag{3}$$

$$2x_1 + x_2 \ge 1 \tag{4}$$

$$2x_1 - 6x_2 \le 15 \tag{5}$$

$$x_1, x_3 \ge 0, \quad x_2 \,\text{free} \tag{6}$$

Without applying any problem transformation, write the dual problem and the complementary slackness conditions (for both problems).

Consider two solutions  $x^1 = [3, -\frac{3}{2}, 0]$  and  $x^2 = [\frac{3}{2}, -2, \frac{3}{2}]$ . Determine the dual complementary solutions and discuss the optimality of both primal solutions.

## Solution

$$\begin{array}{rll} \max & 2y_1 + 3y_2 + y_3 + 15y_4 \\ & -y_1 + y_2 + 2y_3 + 2y_4 & \leq -1 \\ & y_1 + y_3 - 6y_4 & = 2 \\ & y_2 & \leq 0 \\ & y_1, y_4 & \leq 0 \\ & y_2 & free \\ & y_3 & \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Note that  $y_2 \leq 0$  dominates the constraint that  $y_2$  is free. Therefore, the constraint that  $y_2$  is free is not necessary.

The complementary slackness conditions are the following:

$$(-x_1 + x_2 - 2)y_1 = 0$$
  

$$(x_1 + x_3 - 3)y_2 = 0$$
  

$$(2x_1 + x_2 - 1)y_3 = 0$$
  

$$(2x_1 - 6x_2 - 15)y_4 = 0$$
  

$$(-y_1 + y_2 + 2y_3 + 2y_4 + 1)x_1 = 0$$
  

$$(y_1 + y_3 - 6y_4 - 2)x_2 = 0$$
  

$$y_2x_3 = 0$$

Point  $x^1 = [3, -\frac{3}{2}, 0]$  is feasible for the primal problem (z = -6). By using the equations of complementary slackness we infer that:

- Constraint 1:  $-(3) + (-\frac{3}{2}) 2 = -\frac{13}{2} \Longrightarrow y_1 = 0$
- Constraint 2: (3-3) = 0
- Constraint 3:  $(2 \cdot 3 \frac{3}{2} 1) = \frac{7}{2} \Longrightarrow y_3 = 0$
- Constraint 4:  $(2 \cdot 3 + 6 \cdot \frac{3}{2} 15) = 0.$

Dual variable  $y_1$  and  $y_3$  are equal to 0 due to the condition of complementary slackness. Therefore,

$$y_2 + 2y_4 = -1$$
  
 $-6y_4 = 2$ 

We get  $y_2 = -\frac{1}{3}$ ,  $y_4 = -\frac{1}{3}$ , which is a feasible solution to the dual problem and thus  $x^1 = \begin{bmatrix} 3, -\frac{3}{2}, 0 \end{bmatrix}$  is optimal.

Point  $x^2 = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{3}{2}, -2, \frac{3}{2} \end{bmatrix}$  is feasible for the primal problem  $(z = -\frac{11}{2})$ . By using the equations of complementary slackness we infer that:

- Constraint 1:  $-(\frac{3}{2}) + (-2) 2 = -\frac{11}{2} \Longrightarrow y_1 = 0$
- Constraint 2:  $(\frac{3}{2} + \frac{3}{2} 3) = 0$
- Constraint 3:  $(2 \cdot \frac{3}{2} 2 1) = 0$
- Constraint 4:  $(2 \cdot \frac{3}{2} + 6 \cdot 2 15) = 0.$

 $x_3 > 0$  and  $y_2 x_3 = 0$ , therefore  $y_2 = 0$ . The system of dual constraints can be rewritten as:

$$\begin{array}{rcl} 2y_3 + 2y_4 & = & -1 \\ y_3 - 6y_4 & = & 2 \end{array}$$

The solution to the above system yields  $y_4 = -\frac{5}{14} y_3 = -\frac{1}{7}$ , which is not feasible for the dual problem  $(y_3 \ge 0)$ , therefore the considered solution is not optimal.

# Exercise 9

Consider the following Linear Programming problem:

$$\min -2x_1 + 2x_2 - 2x_3$$
  

$$2x_1 - 2x_2 - x_3 \leq 2$$
  

$$-3x_1 + 3x_2 + 2x_3 \leq 3$$
  

$$x_1, x_2, x_3 \geq 0$$

- Write the dual problem.
- Solve the primal problem using the Simplex method with Bland's rule.

# Solution

The dual problem is:

The problem in standard form is:

$$\min -2x_1 + 2x_2 - 2x_3$$
  

$$2x_1 - 2x_2 - x_3 + s_1 = 2$$
  

$$-3x_1 + 3x_2 + 2x_3 + s_2 = 3$$
  

$$x_1, x_2, x_3, s_1, s_2 \ge 0$$

The initial tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$s_1$	$2_2$
	0	-2	2	-2	0	0
$s_1$	2	2	-2	-1	1	0
$s_2$	3	-3	3	2	0	1

**Iteration 1**: Using Bland's rule  $x_1$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{2}{2}\} = 1$ , thus  $s_1$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$s_1$	$2_2$
	2	0	0	-3	1	0
$x_1$	1	1	-1	-0.5	0.5	0
$s_2$	6	0	0	0.5	1.5	1

**Iteration 2**:  $x_3$  enters the basis.  $\theta = \min\{\frac{6}{0.5}\} = 12$ , thus  $s_2$  exists the basis. The next tableau is

		$x_1$	$x_2$	$x_3$	$s_1$	$2_{2}$
	38	0	0	0	10	6
$x_1$	7	1	-1	0	2	1
$x_3$	12	0	0	1	3	2

All the reduced costs are nonnegative, then the optimal solution to the problem is the basis  $(x_1, x_3)$  with values:

$$x_B = \left[ \begin{array}{c} 7\\12 \end{array} \right]$$

The value associated with the optimal solution is -38.